



U 1.2.
WHEN

INTERNATIONAL
COUNCIL
ON HUMAN RIGHTS POLICY

**When Legal Worlds Overlap
Human Rights, State
and Non-State Law**

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	i
INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	iii
I. PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS: PREMISES, DEFINITION AND CONTEXTS	1
Premises: where we start	1
Plural legal orders: what are they?	2
Policies and contexts that give rise to plural legal orders	7
II. GOING BEYOND COMMON PRESUMPTIONS ABOUT LAW, CULTURE AND HUMAN RIGHTS	17
The limits and power of law	17
The relationship between cultural differences and law	18
Speaking about human rights and culture	22
III. HUMAN RIGHTS STANDARDS AND PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS	27
Legal plurality in human rights texts and mechanisms	27
Key issues arising from international standards on plural legal orders	31
IV. UNDERSTANDING NON-STATE LEGAL ORDERS	43
Characterising non-state legal orders	44
The complex relationship between the state and non-state legal orders	46
Challenges to presumptions about the demand for non-state legal orders	49
Unpacking non-state legal orders: revisiting popular generalisations	51
V. FAMILY LAWS – A CASE STUDY OF PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS	63
Weaknesses in standard-setting	64
The relevance of plural legal orders to family law	66
The impact of plural legal orders in family law matters	68
VI. HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACTS OF PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS	73
Discrimination and inequality in law	73
Implications for freedom of religion and belief	74
Jurisdictional confusion, impunity and lack of accountability	75
Undermining access to justice and diluting due process	78
Obstacles to effective development of minority rights	80
Reinforcement of socio-economic inequalities	82
The political implications of legal plurality	84

VII. PLURALITY AND THE ROLE OF THE STATE	89
Recognition, incorporation and decentralisation: terms and meanings	89
Dilemmas and conceptual challenges	94
VIII. CULTURAL DIVERSITY, PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS AND JUSTICE	101
Multiculturalism and the challenges of cultural diversity	101
Cultural diversity, group rights and individual rights	105
Regulating religious arbitration in family law matters	110
IX. AN ASSESSMENT OF JUSTICE SECTOR REFORM	115
Interests underlying the promotion of non-state legal orders	115
Inadequate research and analysis	117
Inconsistent adherence to human rights principles and standards	122
Lack of consultation and meaningful local participation	124
Planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluating legal reform projects	127
X. DEVELOPING A HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH TO PLURAL LEGAL ORDERS	135
The scope for using existing human rights standards	135
The scope for further development of human rights standards	140
XI. A FRAMEWORK FOR HUMAN RIGHTS POLICY AND ADVOCACY	145
How to use the framework	148
The framework	149
BIBLIOGRAPHY	157