

Moretto Claire  
November 2015

MASTER THESIS

Land rights of indigenous peoples in Brazil  
facing large-scale development projects.  
*A case study of the Belo Monte dam with an  
assessment of socio-economic and humanitarian  
issues.*

Supervisors:

Pr. Dr. Hans-Joachim Heintze

*NOHA Director, IFHV, Ruhr-Universität Bochum*

Pr. Dr. Pierre Thielbörger

*IFHV Director, Ruhr-Universität Bochum*

**This thesis is submitted for obtaining the Joint Master's Degree in International Humanitarian Action. By submitting the thesis, the author certifies that the text is from his own hand, does not include the work of someone else unless clearly indicated, and that the thesis has been produced in accordance with proper academic practices.**



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface.....	6
List of acronyms.....	8
Introduction.....	10
1. Background information.....	10
1.1. Indigenous peoples in international law.....	10
1.2. The Belo Monte dam.....	12
1.3. Indigenous peoples and humanitarian action.....	13 ✓
1.4. Rationale and objectives.....	15 ✓
2. Literature review.....	16
3. Methods.....	29 ✓
Chapter 1: Land rights of indigenous peoples in International law: when development projects are among international norms.....	33
1.1 The issue of land rights of indigenous peoples in international law.....	33
1.1.1 Recognition of the importance of the land in the indigenous peoples culture.....	33
1.1.2 The most important instruments: the ILO Conventions and the UNDRIP.....	35
1.1.3 Land rights as Human Rights.....	37
1.2 The right to development in a macro perspective vs indigenous peoples land rights in a micro perspective: the battle of Giants.....	39
1.2.1 The controversial topic of the access to natural resources.....	39
1.2.2 Customary international law: the predominant role of the IACHR.....	41
1.2.3 The right to Free, Prior and Informed Consent: the most important for indigenous peoples facing large-scale development projects.....	43
1.3 The Belo Monte dam and the violations of international law denounced at the three level.....	46
1.3.1 National level: non-respect of the right to Free, Prior and Informed Consent.....	46
1.3.2 Regional level: the IACHR Precautionary Measure n°382-10.....	48
1.3.3 International level: the UPR Brazil 2012.....	50
Chapter 2: Power struggle for development projects: consequences of a Brazilian policy with the dam in Belo Monte.....	53



2.1 Large-scale development projects such as Belo Monte and indigenous peoples rights in Brazil.....	53
2.1.1 Process of environmental licensing for Belo Monte.....	53
2.1.2 Role of the Amazon in the political interests.....	54
2.1.3 Indigenous peoples policy in Brazil.....	56
2.2 Economic interests above Human Rights issues: from theory to practice in Belo Monte.....	58
2.2.1 Economic aspects.....	58
2.2.2 Environmental impacts.....	60
2.2.3 Social impacts.....	63
2.3 Assessment of indigenous peoples vulnerability in this case.....	65
2.3.1 Place of indigenous peoples in the Brazilian society.....	65
2.3.2 Consequences of the dam construction on indigenous peoples territories.....	66
2.3.3 Consequences for their survival.....	68
Chapter 3: From a humanitarian perspective: everything needs to be done.....	72
3.1 Large-scale development projects provoke human suffering.....	72
3.1.1 Humanitarian aspects and indigenous peoples rights.....	72
3.1.2 Analysis of the humanitarian consequences.....	74
3.1.3 Creation of a situation of “ethnocide”.....	75
3.2 Brazil and the humanitarian sector: being an actor instead of being a receiver.....	77
3.2.1 Brazil as leader in the region.....	77
3.2.2 Silence concerning indigenous peoples land rights situation in Brazil.....	78
3.2.3 On the field: few international presence dealing with this issue.....	80
3.3 Assessment of a humanitarian space.....	81
3.3.1 Existence of a humanitarian crisis due to violation of land rights.....	81
3.3.2 Need for international actors to intervene.....	83
3.3.3 Shift of perspective: recommendations.....	84
Conclusion.....	87
Appendices.....	88
1. Law texts.....	88
2. Interviews.....	150



3. Documents.....	197
4. Figures.....	236
5. Tables.....	247
6. Pictures.....	249
References.....	253
Interviews agreements.....	281

- L'approche humanitaire est intervenante par l'aspect de la Soies qui ne se plus par en charge par le Coog-an-Toul-
- Elle permet aussi de passer des projets pré-ou-post-intervention humanitaire:
- \* pré: de l'impact ou de l'impact de ces projets
- \* post: de "intégrer" les conséquences de une "action de"